

The following text and tables are appendix materials for Joanna Motro and Reeve Vanneman (2015), “The 1990s Shift in the Media Portrayal of Working Mothers”, Sociological Forum 30 (4): 209-244.

Internet Appendix A. Examples of working mothers/stay-at-home mothers codes.

- 1. Problems for working mothers.**
- 2. Benefits for working mothers**
- 3. Problems for working mothers’ children.**
- 4. Benefits for working mothers’ children.**
- 5. Problems for stay-at-home mothers.**
- 6. Benefits for stay-at-home mothers.**
- 7. Problems for stay-at-home mothers’ children.**
- 8. Benefits for stay-at-home mothers’ children.**

Internet Appendix B. Number of Articles Codes Appear In for All Eight Codes, by Year.

Internet Appendix C. Inter-coder Reliabilities for Four Themes.

1. Problems for working mothers.

- a. *Distress*. The most important code emphasizes Faludi's recognition of the new backlash theme of the stress, guilt, resentment, or other problems for mothers from combining work and parenting. But now, this code is limited to specific mentions of mothers' stress or guilt. Other, closely related, problems now have separate codes. Regrets of postponing having children are also coded here.

However, if only indecision about roles is noted, not distress or guilt, then code under "mommy wars: personal indecision" (see below).

Examples:

- In truth, many working mothers feel guilty about leaving their babies with someone else. They worry about the possible long-term effects of day care. They wonder whether the "quality time" spent with their children makes up for the quantity of time spent away from them. (NYT1981_02)
- Her book is nonetheless the stuff of 3 A.M. self-recrimination orgies. "A Mother's Work" is upsetting -especially in its harrowing portrait of life in mediocre day-care centers - simply because if you scratch a working mother, you will find not the smug narcissist Mrs. Fallows believes inhabits the corner office, but a thin-skinned, guilt- and ambivalence-riddled creature who is worried that her career will cause her children unhappiness. (NYT1985_01)
- Still, after-school isolation often means anxiety for both parent and child. Employers often say that productivity drops markedly after 3 P.M., when parents start to receive calls from their children at home, and studies have found that child-rearing problems contribute substantially to absenteeism and turnover. (NYT1987_24) ["anxiety" is coded for *working mothers' distress*; "Productivity drops" is coded for *working mothers' problems at work*. 1c]
- But other welfare experts argue that mothers forced into low-wage jobs that are unfulfilling might be resentful, overwhelmed by stress and unable to pay for quality child care. (NYT1994_04)
- "My husband's a great help watching our baby. But as far as doing housework or even taking the baby when I'm at home, no. He figures he works five days a week; he's not going to come home and clean. But he doesn't stop to think that I work seven days a week. Why should I have to come home and do the housework without help from anybody else?" (NYT1997_06)
- "I wonder, maybe people are feeling like it's too hard to combine work and children," Ms. Galinsky said. (NYT2000_09)
- HEADLINE: Angst and the Working Mother (NYT2002_23)
- Thirty years ago, the first generation of moms with careers were racked by guilt that they weren't being good hausfraus. But things have evolved: today's working mothers are racked by guilt that they aren't achieving enough professionally. (P.S.: They're still worried about being good moms, too.) (NYT2004_11)
- They expected to be both their mothers (or their rosy memory of what their mothers had been) and their fathers (who won the bread but never dreamed of baking it), and because that is an impossible task, they felt they had failed. The old guideposts were gone, and new ones had not been established. What was a good wife? (NYT2010_13)

2. Benefits for Working Mothers

- a. *Personal, non-economic benefits.* A working mother's sense of fulfillment or self-confidence provided by work. A mother's report that she enjoys work or is looking for fulfilling work.

Examples:

- Most respondents who described themselves as feminists and a majority of the working women, however, said they felt that both parents working had had positive or no effects at all on families. Among the positive effects mentioned were fulfillment of working women, added financial security, improved family communications and independence for children. (NYT1981_04) [This quotation also includes codes for economic benefits (2b) and benefits for children (4a)]
- Several welfare recipients in New Jersey said that the new law gave them strong financial incentives to quit their jobs, but they added that they probably would continue working to maintain their self respect. (NYT1981_20)
- Psychological well-being in women is often enhanced by involvement in an interesting occupation and the most stressful experiences for women concern their family roles rather than problems on the job, they report. (NYT1985_06) [This second half of this quote is also coded for "*Negative effects: distress*" because of the stress from family roles]
- What - other than economic necessity - prompts a woman to go back to work after giving birth? Fear that she will lose her hard-won place in the corporate hierarchy? Fear of becoming dependent on her husband? Fear of being bored? It is not easy, after commanding respect and attention in the corporate world, to become "just a mother." (NYT1988_09) ["Fear of being bored" is coded for *non-economic benefits to working mothers*; "Fear that she will lose her hard-won place in the corporate hierarchy" is coded for *economic benefits* (2b); the last sentence "just a mother" is coded for *negative effects of being a stay-at-home mother* (5b). All are coded.]
- Dr. Paget said. "A mother who's been away from the work force for a few years may find new sources of energy and develop a higher sense of self-esteem by getting an outside job." (NYT1990_03)
- Yet many working-class mothers who have found that they are happy working treat it like a guilty secret. Mrs. Lencki dropped her voice almost to a whisper when she talked about enjoying her job, despite her guilt that her youngest son had not had her full-time presence. (NYT1992_02) [the combination of "enjoying her job" and "despite her guilt" results in codes for both *non-economic benefits*" and for *distress for working mothers* (1a).]
- Surveys of working mothers show that most value the independence and sense of mastery they derive from their jobs. (NYT1996_18)
- Yet the percentage saying they got a "great deal" or "a very great deal" of satisfaction from their family lives is somewhat higher for mothers who work than for those who don't; perhaps a busy life that combines employment and child rearing is also a fulfilling one. (NYT2004_02)
- Ms. Cuevas, 39, so relished the independence afforded her by working that a few years ago she took a second job, sewing curtains at night in her cramped living room while her sons, Argenis and Andy, slept in the next room. (NYT2008_12)

3. Problems for Working Mothers' Children

- a. *Working Mothers: Problems for Children*: Any educational, emotional, interpersonal or other problems of children of working mothers; less supervision or quality interaction with children by working mothers even if no evidence or assertion of harm; also, expressions of concern about the effects of mother's work on children, even without actual evidence. Problems for children from day care arrangements or complaints by children themselves are coded separately (see below, b and c for child care and d for complaints).

Examples:

- "Now," she explained, "the children don't know how to do many of the things I expect them to do. Thirteen-year-old John is eager to cook, but there is too little time to teach him. (NYT1981_03)
- Mrs. Fallows's first principle is that mothers who leave their children in others' care are jeopardizing their formative years. As she points out: "When both parents work, especially in nonroutine, professional positions, it's too often the case that the mother and the father have to cut corners with their children every day (NYT1985_01)
- Despite the new findings, some child development experts express concern about the possible hidden costs of children coming home to an empty house. "The latchkey arrangement has many problems, and the younger the child the greater the risks," said Thomas Long, director of the Center for Family Research at Catholic University. "There's physical risk from fire, for example. There's emotional risk, fear, loneliness and feelings of abandonment. And then there's the stress, especially if a youngster is responsible for younger kids." (NYT1988_31)
- "The rich, close relationships my family enjoys took hours and hours to develop," Mrs. Jones said. "In my day, women who didn't work spent hours creating things with their children, and those things are what my children remember now as adults. I'm in awe of my daughter's accomplishments, but I worry that the demands on her time might be detrimental to the next generation." (NYT1993_03)
- 1946 [edition of Dr. Spock's *Baby and Child Care*]: To work or not to work? Some mothers have to work to make a living. Usually their children turn out all right, because some reasonably good arrangement is made for their care. But others grow up neglected and maladjusted. It would save money in the end if the government paid a comfortable allowance to all mothers (of young children) who would otherwise be compelled to work.(NYT1998_31)
- Last week, in *Child Development*, the journal of the Society for Research in Child Development, a group of respected Columbia University researchers reported that children whose mothers worked more than 30 hours a week by the time they were 9 months old got lower scores on school readiness tests at age 3. (NYT2002_03)
- "Some children are spending evenings alone because their mothers work at night," Mr. Koido said, explaining that students' home environment had become a problem in recent years. "They can't focus in the classroom. They're late, not just by minutes but by hours." (NYT2006_43)

4. Benefits for Working Mothers' Children

- a. *Positive effects of mother's work on children.* Evidence of social and economic benefits to children of mother's work. Increased independence or sense of responsibility of children. Economic benefits for children are also coded here (and usually double-coded for *working mothers' economic benefits.*)

However, testimonials by children or a mother's assertion that her work sets a good example for her children are coded below in the closely related sub-code, *working mothers' role model for family.*

Examples:

- "The group with employed mothers were more peer-oriented and self-sufficient," Dr. Schachter said. "The group with non-employed mothers appeared more adult-oriented and dependent," demonstrating their dependency by soliciting help and protection from teachers. They were also jealous of the teachers' attention. (NYT1981_02) [The first sentence is coded for *positive effects for working mothers' children*; the rest is coded for the closely related *negative effects for stay-at-home mothers' children.*]
- Many child psychologists see important benefits [of mothers' working]. These children tend to have a more positive view of women than did previous generations, and they are exposed to a wider range of career possibilities... And the children may develop greater self-esteem as a result of their exceptional advantages: they attend the finest schools, are groomed for the best colleges and are offered a host of costly extracurricular activities. (NYT1988_02)
- But feminists in particular have tried to carve out a new definition, arguing that the traditional ideal held out an unrealistic standard of perfection and that a self-fulfilled mother has more to offer her children. (NYT1994_02)
- Ms. Mott, the Wall Street analyst, tells her children a similar story. "I work so we can have money for the things we enjoy," she tells them, like a vacation or a new bicycle. (NYT1997_01) [This is also coded for *economic benefits for working mothers.*]
- Peters makes a point that is interesting and true -- and that should have been self-evident eons ago: that responsible adults who are happy and fulfilled themselves make better parents than isolated, frustrated ones. (NYT1998_10)
- Perhaps writing, absorbing Alice [Munro] as it did, offered her daughters a protection, a gift. They were not her work, so they were freed from her manipulation. (NYT2002_32)
- Then there are the obvious financial benefits. When a mother works, average annual household income rises by \$10,000 per child in a two-parent home, and by \$11,000 in a single-parent home. For many children, these earnings are the difference between living in poverty -- or out of it. (NYT2003_01) [This is also coded for *economic benefits for working mothers.*]
- Poor children suffer no psychological damage when their mothers move from welfare to work, as millions of women have in recent years, a major new study says. Among adolescents in such families, the researchers say, mental health may actually have improved. (NYT2003_05)
- For generations black women have viewed work as a means for elevating not only their own status as women, but also as a crucial force in elevating their family, extended family and their entire race. (NYT2006_01) [also coded for *non-economic benefits for working mothers*]

5. Problems for stay-at-home mothers

- a. *Distress, isolation, boredom, lack of support.* Social or personal problems resulting from being a stay-at-home mother. Feelings of frustration, dependency, or lack of fulfillment without a job or career. Isolation and lack of contacts with other adults. Regrets that not working has hurt the women's movement. The text can be a self-report, a speculation by a working mother what staying home would be like, an academic study, an expert opinion, or the testimony of another family member (e.g., a daughter about her mother).

Examples:

- "I made the choice to stay home, but I like to know that if I wanted to get a job or finish college, when the kids get a little older, I could," said Bess Avalone of New Brunswick, N.J., a 28-year-old mother of three. "If I thought being a housewife was it for the rest of my life, I would probably feel like a prisoner." (NYT1983_01)
- Studies show that women who stay home with children are more prone to depression and stress-related illnesses than working mothers; (NYT1988_05)
- In "The Feminine Mystique," Ms. Friedan wrote of "the problem that has no name stirring in the minds of so many American women" - the fact that they were not satisfied even though they had all that society told them they needed for happiness: a husband, a home, a family. And many women did go into the workplace in a search for fulfillment. (NYT1989_05)
- The new full-time mother often suffers an attack of the postpartum blues. But are the blues caused by changing hormones or do they come from looking at the same walls for more than a week straight? (NYT1990_06)
- Mrs. Ornstein grew up in a middle-class family in the Mill Basin neighborhood of Brooklyn, where her father was a textile salesman and her mother stayed at home to raise her. "She was a very dependent person and I never wanted to be in that position." (NYT1992_01)
- Suzanne Page, 34, of Hastings-on-Hudson told of giving up her career as a research scientist. "I could never have predicted how sad I would feel," Ms. Page said. (NYT1996_06) - She did not enjoy being a homemaker and is happier now that she is back working full time as the marketing manager for Lucent Technologies' New England region. (NYT1997_02) [This is also coded for *non-economic benefits for working mothers* (2a).]
- And her spells on welfare have never lasted more than a couple of months. "I felt that was lazy, just sitting around getting a check," she said. "That would lower my self-esteem. I've always been a worker." (NYT1999_02)
- Many [Japanese] women over 50 found marriage to be a disappointment and motherhood to be a burden. They tell that to their adult daughters, and that makes their daughters want to stay single. They doubt whether husbands and children are worth it." (NYT2001_22)
- I see myself in a courtroom, arguing with people. I'd like to be home when my kids are little, but I don't think I'd give up work altogether -- I'd be so bored, have to give up so much I worked so hard for." (NYT2001_39)
- "It was wrenching for me to leave Channel 2," she says. "I miss being the lioness in the newsroom -- to walk through and have the interns say, 'There she goes.' ... I do feel somehow that I let the cause down." (NYT2003_11)

6. Benefits for Stay-at-Home Mothers

a. Fulfillment, enjoyment. Strong sense of identity, pride, or accomplishment as a mother; stimulation of working with and developing children; appreciates freedom of controlling her own day; satisfactions of maternal instincts; motherhood as a great calling; managerial skills developed by motherhood.

Examples:

My mother, born early in this century, took strength from her position as homemaker. This is the work she chose to do in life, not being an executive secretary, for which she had been trained, or a nurse, like her sister. Arranging my father's comforts and supervising and teaching us children was for her an honorable and productive goal. (NYT1981_29)

A 26-year-old second-year M.B.A. student at Harvard says: "My plans are to go out and prove my stuff in a traditional M.B.A. job for a few years. But I don't see myself staying there once I have a child. I see motherhood as a very special part of being a woman and I think when the kids are little it would be a lot of fun to be home with them." (NYT1986_02)

We're finally believing that our family responsibilities and concerns have added the managerial skills to our resumes that make us valuable. (NYT1990_20)

"The most important thing you're going to get in your life is your children," Mrs. Murdock said, explaining why the family has given up eating out, planning for a bigger house and having many other extras. "I just can't imagine giving that responsibility to someone else." (NYT1992_02)

"I'm proud of my daughter the doctor," said Mrs. Rosen, 72, a homemaker in Chicago. "But I think of all those latkes I fried, how excited the children were to help, how satisfying all that was to me. My mother did it, and her mother did it and I worry that my daughter is missing that joy." (NYT1993_03)

My children, my "projects," are my passion. I will risk overzealousness; whether they thank me or not, I will never look back on their childhoods with regret. (NYT1994_10)

Women who feel strongly that they want to be home usually are better off for doing so, said Janice Steil, professor of psychology at Adelphi University. (NYT1997_12)

Karenna says, her mother, at 52, is "a little bit sad" about her soon-to-be empty nest... "She loves being a mom," Karenna says. "She's so naturally maternal, and that's what she's best at and what makes her most happy." (NYT2000_32)

At the top of this parental literary class is Daphne de Marneffe's *Maternal Desire: On Children, Love, and the Inner Life* (Little, Brown, \$25.95), a refined discussion of "the eros of parenthood." Mothering is full of pleasure and desire, writes de Marneffe. (NYT2004_01)

Research is showing how hormones elevated in parenting can help buffer mothers from anxiety and stress -- a timely gift from a sometimes compassionate Mother Nature. (NYT2005_11)

More stay-at-home mothers give themselves better marks as parents than do mothers who work outside the home, according to an analysis released Thursday. (NYT2009_01)

7. Problems for children of Stay-at-Home Mothers

a. *Personal problems, negative effects of stay-at-home mothers.* Any emotional, educational, interpersonal or other problems of children of stay-at-home mothers; lack of independence; less quality time for children by stay-at-home mothers; over-bearing mothering.

Examples:

"The group [of children] with nonemployed mothers appeared more adult-oriented and dependent," demonstrating their dependency by soliciting help and protection from teachers. They were also jealous of the teachers' attention. (NYT1981_02)

"And depressed mothers have depressing effects on their children," she added. She believes that children are better off in a stimulating day-care environment than at home with depressed mothers. (NYT1984_01)

"The nub of it is what the attitudes of the parents are and how available they are to their children. I don't mean just hours - I mean emotionally. You can find damaged children in families where the mother stays home. Haven't you seen it before? The mother is at home, but her head is someplace else, and she can't mother the kids properly." (NYT1988_02)

Do we really need to be shown again that time spent with children is not the ultimate measure of good motherhood? That stay-at-home mothers who are bored, resentful, punitive, depressed or anxious about finances aren't going to be so great for their kids? It seems so. (NYT1998_04)

Conversely, the researchers said, when mothers leave the labor force, adolescent children are more likely to display behavioral problems. "Teenagers may express their feelings of disappointment or worry about finances as depression or anger when their mothers leave employment," the study said. (NYT2003_05)

The women's evolution [in a New York theater drama] takes the audience through their decision to stay at home, commuter marriage, sexual dry spells, depression and breaking points. Liza hides in the bushes outside her home to escape the kids. Alison slaps her daughter in a moment of anger. (NYT2004_04) [also coded for "Problems for Stay-at-Home Mothers"]

In the court decisions I read, stay-at-home mothers were often described as "smothering" and "without boundaries" while working mothers lacked sufficient "quality time" with their children. It seemed there was no winning. (NYT2005_23)

Bennetts [in her book *Feminine Mistake*] portrays the stay-at-home mother as a financial and emotional drain on her husband; a bad example for their children; and a disappointment to her gender, to society and, worst of all, to herself. (NYT2007_01)

8 P.M. (ABC) WIFE SWAP In this season premiere, Ro Drago is a stay-at-home mom in New Jersey who pays more attention to her doll collection than to her three children, who are allowed to do as they please. (NYT2010_15)

8. Benefits for Children of Stay-at-Home Mothers

a. A specific or a general benefit to children if their mother does not work. The benefit may be some improved characteristic of the child (e.g., school test scores, self-confidence), something material (e.g., home-cooked meals), something more intangible (e.g., good memories), or just more time and attention for the children. Not coded if the benefit is presented only as a "myth" or old-fashioned belief. Also, not coded if the supposed benefit is just a general *belief* that staying home is better for kids (that would be coded as normative acknowledgement of stay-at-home mothers); there should be a specific example of some child benefiting or some evidence for a general benefit.

Examples:

When we came in from school or the playhouse, she would ... set us to our studies, supervising, correcting, challenging. What she demanded in the way of performance, she was willing to help see through. Assuring that we all finished our homework was more important to her plans for the future than knitting a sweater or putting up 24 quarts of peaches. (NYT1981_29)

Much research on child care and development has focused on infant-mother attachment, a quality many psychologists consider a cornerstone of emotional and social development. This theory says children with a secure attachment, usually to the mother, in infancy are more likely to feel confident as they explore their surroundings, to have good relations with peers and teachers and to be more competent at solving problems, said Susan Spieker, a psychologist at the University of Washington. (NYT1992_03)

Margaret Koestner of East Northport, the bilingual assistant, had initially returned to work, leaving her daughter in her mother's care. But after a month on the job she decided to stay home, to give her child the "same memories I have from my mom, like the smell of fresh-baked bread when I came home from school. (NYT1996_19)

She senses that her younger children, with whom she spends more time reading and going on outings to places like museums, are more relaxed than her older children were when she was working. (NYT1997_02)

Eight-year-olds are deeply conservative.... And when it comes to their mothers, they are steadfastly retrograde, shunning the new, self-fulfilled model. Especially now, when 70 percent of mothers work, a stay-at-home mom has become the ultimate trophy, reflecting prosperity and proving to the children that they are, in fact, the center of the universe. (NYT1998_05)

Welfare let the many single mothers here give their children in time what they could not in material things (NYT2001_31)

When my children have questions, hurts or cause to celebrate, I'm right there. They don't have to wait until 6 p.m. (NYT2001_43)

"Being a corporate mom, you work a lot of hours, you feed them dinner -- maybe," she said. "This morning, we baked cookies together. I have time to help them with homework. I'm attending church. The house is managed by me. Just a lot more homemaker-type stuff, which I think is more nurturing to them." (NYT2009_25)

Internet Appendix B. Number of Articles Codes Appear In for All Eight Codes, by Year.

Year	Total Number of Articles in Sample	Total Number of Articles with Any of the 8 Codes	Problems for Working Mothers	Benefits for Working Mothers	Problems for Stay-at-Home Mothers	Benefits for Stay-at-Home Mothers	Problems for Children of Working Mothers	Benefits for Children of Working Mothers	Problems for Children of Stay-at-Home Mothers	Benefits for Children of Stay-at-Home Mothers
1981	38	17	11	2	3	1	6	5	1	1
1982	10	5	3	0	0	0	2	0	1	0
1983	19	8	3	3	0	0	3	0	0	1
1984	28	8	3	3	2	0	3	0	1	0
1985	14	8	5	3	3	0	2	0	0	0
1986	35	15	8	1	2	1	5	4	0	1
1987	24	11	5	1	0	0	5	2	0	0
1988	40	12	6	1	2	0	6	4	2	0
1989	25	10	7	1	0	0	6	6	0	0
1990	20	11	9	3	1	0	4	1	0	1
1991	11	1	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0
1992	34	14	10	2	0	1	6	3	1	1
1993	26	8	5	0	0	0	2	1	0	0
1994	29	11	8	3	0	0	4	6	0	1
1995	26	7	4	0	0	0	0	3	0	0
1996	33	7	1	3	1	1	1	2	0	1
1997	34	16	10	6	4	1	5	6	0	2
1998	46	17	11	5	1	1	3	3	0	1
1999	33	11	9	2	1	0	3	2	0	0
2000	36	11	6	0	1	0	3	3	0	0
2001	43	16	7	1	3	1	2	5	0	3
2002	42	19	13	0	1	0	6	0	0	1
2003	25	13	10	2	3	0	1	3	0	0
2004	17	8	2	1	2	2	0	2	1	1
2005	26	12	9	0	1	0	1	1	1	0
2006	47	29	21	2	6	1	4	5	0	1
2007	40	15	8	2	4	1	2	1	0	0
2008	32	14	9	1	3	0	2	2	0	1
2009	26	13	6	1	2	1	2	2	0	2
Total	859	347	210	49	46	12	90	72	8	19

Internet Appendix C. Inter-coder Reliabilities for Four Themes.

Author and Student 1, N=241						
Code	Number of Articles (Author)	Number of Articles (Student 1)	Agreement (percent)	Expected Agreement (percent)	Kappa	Gamma
Distressed Working Mothers	66	63	80.5	60.8	0.50	0.84
Feminist Defense of Working Mothers	24	30	90	80.1	0.50	0.93
Conventional Family Critique of Working Mothers	35	30	87.1	76.6	0.45	0.87
Feminist Defense of Children of Working Mothers	23	15	91.7	85.4	0.43	0.92

Author and Student 2, N=209						
Code	Number of Articles (Author)	Number of Articles (Student 2)	Agreement (percent)	Expected Agreement (percent)	Kappa	Gamma
Distressed Working Mothers	55	69	82.8	58.1	0.59	0.91
Feminist Defense of Working Mothers	22	37	87.1	75.5	0.47	0.91
Conventional Family Critique of Working Mothers	27	33	88.5	75.4	0.53	0.91
Feminist Defense of Children of Working Mothers	17	32	89	79.1	0.47	0.93